

concluding statement in his book has therefore the sweep of a final irrevocable sentence: "Aber das Wesentliche des Problems des Charakters der Tonarten nach der negativen wie nach der positiven Seite hin halte ich durch diese Untersuchungen für gelöst." The question is, can we agree with him?

Mies is best known for his investigation of the Beethoven sketches (1925; English translation 1929). Besides publications dealing particularly with the song in the 19th century, his new book seems to be his first attempt at dealing with a problem of farther reaching, more fundamental importance. Nevertheless he puts limitations on his inquiry. He renounces theoretical considerations in favor of the investigation of actual compositions. These compositions are mostly cyclic with respect to keys, in the sense of Bach's *Wohltemperirtes Clavier*. The majority of the composers are German or Austrian with a few exceptions such as Clementi or Chopin. The compositions cover the period from the beginning of the 18th century to our time and are divided into four groups: baroque, classic, romantic, and modern. All the considered works are written for tempered keyboard instruments with the exception of the complete works of Beethoven and Brahms, which are added as supplementary material.

In the main part of his book Mies analyzes his material, grouping it under all the major and minor keys. In a concluding section he summarizes his findings both in text and in the form of tables.

It is not surprising that the limited scope of Mies's material and inquiry should yield limited results. He is honest enough to draw clearly this conclusion: "Ein allgemeiner Charakter der Tonart, unabhängig von Komponist, Zeit, Hörer usw. existiert nicht." On the positive side, Mies points to several common characteristics of many keys existing in a varying degree, provided the keys are investigated together with rhythm, meter, and tempo and with respect to a given period or composer. Occasionally he is able to give interesting sidelights of a rather statistical nature on such relationships. His lack of sufficient terminological and aesthetical investiga-

tion, as well as the exclusion of historical, social, and cultural material, makes this study fall considerably short of a solution of the "essence of the problem of the character of keys in negative as well as positive respect."

Besides that, one wonders whether the problem of the characteristics of keys is of more than special subjective interest. In order to answer this question, however, musicology has to pierce its purely analytical and historical boundaries and advance to the philosophical implications of its status as a scholarly discipline.

WOLF FRANCK  
New York, N. Y.

Mario Rinaldi. *Antonio Vivaldi*. Milano: Istituto d'alta cultura, 1943. 564 pp.

Mario Rinaldi. *Catalogo numerico tematico delle composizioni di Antonio Vivaldi*. Roma: Editrice cultura moderna [1945]. 311 pp.

Marc Pincherle. *Antonio Vivaldi et la musique instrumentale*. Paris: Floury, 1948. 2 vols., 318, 74 pp.

RINALDI's book on Antonio Vivaldi came about as a result of the newly awakened interest in the Venetian master caused by the Vivaldi Festival which was organized by the late Alfredo Casella at Count Chigi's beautiful palace in Siena in 1939. While it is by no means the first Italian study on Vivaldi, it is as far as I know the first full length volume which attempts at once a detailed study of the Venetian master's life and his works. The sad truth must be said, however: the Rinaldi volume is a bad book, full of errors and poorly written. It certainly should not have been allowed to see the light of day, for it gives a very unfortunate picture of Italian musicology of the present. The book was obviously a rush job; much of the discussion of the music is little more than a patchwork of written opinions by other critics.

The first chapter, ten pages long, attempts to paint a picture of the epoch in

which Vivaldi lived and worked. Compared with the similar attempt made in the new Pincherle book, Rinaldi's treatment is sketchy and entirely unoriginal. Chapter two deals with the biography of the "prete rosso." Over 100 pages long, this is the best part of the volume. It presents a fairly accurate picture of Vivaldi's career, incorporating the then latest research, for example, that on the much disputed matter of Vivaldi's birth and death dates. The third chapter, entitled *Spirito e valori dell' arte Vivaldiana*, presents a picture of all facets of Vivaldi's art. The chapter includes a discussion of the forms and style of Vivaldi's instrumental music (which compared to Pincherle's masterly treatment of the same subject seems like mere child's play). The chapter also includes some discussion of the Vivaldi cantatas, the chamber music for violin and violoncello, the operas, and sacred music. All this compressed into 176 pages!

I must confess that as I am at present making a study of the Vivaldi operas, I paid closest attention to Rinaldi's remarks about these. It would seem that even though he devotes considerable space to the topic, he has obviously done little more than make a *pasticcio* of other critics' remarks. Of course, he did not forget to copy off the titles from the manuscripts of the operas in the Biblioteca Nazionale at Turin. He devotes many pages of discussion to the opera *L'Olimpiade*—probably, I suspect, because that work had been presented at Siena in 1939 and material on it was therefore most easily available. But had Rinaldi compared the score of that Siena performance with the original Vivaldi score, he would have been able to tell us that the work as presented by Mortari and Casella at Siena was a mere shadow of its former self. Because of the author's scant knowledge of these operas, his table of *Melodrammi ed Oratori* at the back of the book is incomplete and often erroneous and, furthermore, causes him often to make naive but dogmatic statements within the main body of his text.

For example, on page 268, speaking about Vivaldi's first opera, *Ottone in Villa*, Rinaldi says that unfortunately very little,

if anything, is known about this work. After telling us the date of the work and the name of its librettist, he goes on to say that, as the libretto is lost, he can tell us nothing about the story or the names of the original interpreters. Had he taken the trouble, he could have found an excellent copy of the original printed libretto of that 1713 performance in the town library at Vicenza where the work was originally given. Discussing the music of *Ottone in Villa*, Rinaldi speaks only of one of the duets from the second act which he apparently had come across in a copy in one of the manuscript volumes of Vivaldi's cantatas, apparently forgetting that the entire three-act score of *Ottone* was right there with the other opera scores in the Foà-Giordano collection at Turin. It is amusing to observe that the plots of some of the operas the author discusses are often inaccurately related. This doubtless comes of not reading the libretti straight through, preferring instead to copy verbatim the summaries of the action as narrated in the introductory portion of the printed libretti. Unfortunately, often-times such outlines were either extremely brief and incomplete synopses of highlights of the action, while at other times these summaries were condensations not of the action of the opera itself but of the fore-action. Nor can Signor Rinaldi even be trusted to copy correctly from the printed libretti the names of the characters and their interpreters. Upon comparing his listings with the originals I have discovered many irritating mistakes.

The fourth chapter, which consumes but eighteen pages, tells briefly about earlier Italian attempts at Vivaldi research; it also mentions concerts and festivals of Vivaldi's music and tells the story behind the Foà-Giordano collections and how this fountainhead of material eventually found its way to the shelves of the war-scarred Biblioteca Nazionale in Turin.

The fifth and last chapter, which consists of about 200 pages, is devoted to a collection of some source materials about the composer: the documents discovered by Gallo pertaining to Vivaldi's death; the seven letters of Vivaldi to the Marquis Guido Bentivoglio d'Aragona; an excerpt

from Goldoni's *Memoirs* which mentions the "prete rosso"; and a list of six portraits of the maestro. Then follow various catalogues of Vivaldi's music. First we find a list of original instrumental and vocal printed editions, with indications of modern transcriptions. Next follows the table of the dramatic works mentioned above, and finally, a listing of each unpublished composition as it appears in order in the various Vivaldi manuscripts in Italian libraries and abroad. All this, unfortunately, is of little use as it is incomplete and gives far too little information.

The classic error in Rinaldi's catalogue listing is his mistaking Vivaldi's handwritten abbreviation for the Italian designation of some concertos intended for five instruments. As the Italian word for "instruments" is "stromenti," its abbreviation is, of course, "str." Rinaldi, however, read this abbreviation as "tr." which is the abbreviation for the Italian word "tromba": and so items 7, 8, 25, 26, and 37 in Rinaldi's list of contents of volume seven of the Foà collection and items 11 and 12 of volume eight of the Giordano collection are listed as *Concerto cinque tr.* ("Concerto for five trumpets")! One wonders what Vivaldi would have said.

Finally, we come to a group of thematic catalogues of Vivaldi's music, both printed and autograph. The old Altmann catalogue of printed works is reproduced in full; it is followed by a useful thematic catalogue of the instrumental works, sacred works, and cantatas found in the Turin collections, along with a short thematic catalogue of a few Vivaldi works found in libraries abroad. These latter were originally prepared with care by Miss Olga Rudge, secretary of the Accademia Chigiana in Siena.

The entire volume is brought to a close with the customary bibliography. Examples of its style are provided by the following listings:

Caffi Francesco—*Iscrizioni*, vol. V.  
Encyclopedie of Chamber Music—  
Edit. W. Cobbet.

There are some musical illustrations within the main body of the text but not so many as one would wish.

The only value of a book like this, in my opinion, is that it brings together between two covers a great deal of important information about Vivaldi. However, the volume must be used with the greatest care; judging by my own experience, every statement in it ought to be checked most scrupulously.

As he says in the Preface to his *Catalogo numerico tematico delle composizioni di Antonio Vivaldi* (written in Italian, French, atrocious English, German, and Russian!), Rinaldi intended this volume to accompany the book just discussed. Though the frontispiece appears without a printed date, two years elapsed before this 300-page work reached the market. Like his other book, this is not very helpful: it is but a re-hash of his earlier catalogue with some expansion (is anybody interested in what pieces of Vivaldi are in C Major?). Since he has sliced the meat in as many ways as possible, the result is more confusing than helpful. Its most presumptuous aspect is the assigning of new opus numbers by Rinaldi to groups of compositions after Vivaldi's original opus numbers cease.

The new Pincherle volumes on Vivaldi, written in French, are quite another matter, and fortunately so. Here is a scholarly work of which the author can well be proud, a distinguished contribution to knowledge upon this subject. Here is a study of Vivaldi's instrumental music that is accurate, informative, executed with deep critical insight, and obviously done with loving care. Those Italians who still believe that they, and only they, have the right to be the authorities on Italian music are going to be disappointed that so far the best book on Vivaldi (and on Corelli too, for that matter) has been done by a scholar of another land.

The Pincherle work consists of two volumes, the second a most valuable, helpful, and complete thematic catalogue of the instrumental works, put together with the greatest accuracy. One finds also in this volume a table of both printed and manuscript collections along with a list of modern transcriptions.

Exclusive of the customary appendices

in a scholarly work like this—excellently done, as one would expect—Vol. I is divided into three parts. The first chapter of Part One gives the only complete and accurate account of Vivaldi's life that has appeared to date; the second chapter presents a most vivid sketch of the musical life in Venice in the time of the "prete rosso." Nowhere else, not even in Italian volumes on the music of the period, is there such a broad, inclusive, and exciting picture of this beehive of musical activity. Pincherle, it seems, has gathered all the important facts and has breathed life into the telling of them.

The second part of Vol. I gives us first an excellent summary of Vivaldi's works, both instrumental and vocal; the rest of the second part is devoted to a brilliant discussion of all phases of Vivaldi's instrumental style: the make-up of his orchestral forces, the nature of his musical materials, his treatment of both concerto grosso and solo concerto forms, and his "Sinfonie." The closing chapter in Part Two is a discussion of Vivaldi's descriptive music, which is interesting indeed since, except for his well-known opus 8, we never think of this composer as a writer of program music.

The third part of this first volume is a highly interesting discussion of Vivaldi's influence in Italy, Germany and Austria, France, and England, and this is followed by some interesting general remarks about the extent and permanence of Vivaldi's influence. Both volumes are, of course, copiously illustrated with musical examples and other material.

It seems to me that this work on Vivaldi's instrumental music is one of the finest musicological studies to appear in a long while. It is accurate, informative, and very readable, and it discusses with clarity and common sense what is after all the thing of importance—the music itself. Here is an extremely distinguished volume which

\*Unfortunately, the Biblioteca Capitolare of Treviso was almost completely destroyed during the war. A fire in the vicinity, started by bombs, was allowed to spread unchecked. Through unfortunate circumstances the danger was not brought to the attention of the right man and on the next morning the venerable library was a heap of ashes. Our readers will

ought to be read and studied by everyone interested in music.

JONATHAN SCHILLER  
University of Illinois

Claudio Sartori. *Bibliografia delle opere musicali stampate da Ottaviano Petrucci*. Firenze: Olschki, 1948. 220 pp.

ABOUT one hundred years ago Anton Schmid, librarian of the National Library in Vienna, wrote a monograph dedicated to the work of Ottaviano Petrucci, the first great printer of polyphonic music. Since then the interest of bibliophiles and historians of music in Petrucci's work has increased steadily, due to the technical perfection of Petrucci's prints as well as to the immense artistic treasures which they preserve. In approximately twenty years the great printer issued monumental collections of all forms of secular, spiritual, and liturgical music, comprising a repertory that dates from *ca.* 1460 to 1520 and presenting composers of the stature of de la Rue, Obrecht, Agricola, Brumel, Isaac, Mouton, Compère, Gaspar, Carpentras, Févin, Tromboncino, Cara, and especially Josquin des Prez. In 1882 Vernarecci published a new book on Petrucci, in which he filled many gaps left by Schmid. A study of Italian archives had enabled Vernarecci to throw considerable light upon Petrucci's life and the vicissitudes of his printing enterprise. Later Catelani, Haberl, Gaspari, Barclay Squire, Trend, and Einstein have brought to light a substantial number of works from Petrucci's print shop that had remained unknown to Schmid. Especially, however, the last twenty years have seen a greatly intensified interest in Petrucci's editions. In 1932 the *Bolletino bibliografico* of Milan issued a facsimile edition of the *Odhecaton*, using the copy of 1504 of the Biblioteca Capitolare in Treviso;<sup>1</sup> in 1935

be interested to know that the two Petrucci prints, the *Odhecaton* and the *Canti C*, as well as about half of the precious musical MSS, were saved through the foresight of the *vicebibliotecario*, Monsignor G. D'Alessi, who kept them at his home. This valiant self-made musical scholar had compiled a catalogue of the precious library of 16th-century prints